



## **FSC® General Assembly 2017**

Vancouver, Canada, 8–13 October

# **Report on Result of Motions voted on at the 2017 General Assembly**

V1-0

**20 November 2017**



All Rights Reserved FSC® International 2017 FSC®F000100

## Part 1: Overview

**Explanation of voting:** There were two full days of debating and voting on motions (October 12 and 13). Motions were prioritized for voting by all members present and these were combined by chamber to provide a priority list for each chamber.

They were then debated and voted on in rotation, taking the top remaining priority from each chamber in turn as follows 1<sup>st</sup> Social Chamber, 2<sup>nd</sup> Environmental Chamber and 3<sup>rd</sup> Economic chamber. Any that had not been voted on by the close of business of the General Assembly are considered lost and no further action will be taken. Where a very clear outcome was indicated by the discussion a vote by show of cards was taken but wherever that did not provide a clear result (or when requested by one or more members) an electronic ballot was held with signed paper votes which were scanned and electronically counted and weighted by chamber.

To pass motions need an overall two thirds majority in favour **and** a simple majority (50%+1) in each chamber in favour. A motion which had a two thirds majority overall still failed if any one chamber's support fell below 50% +1. (FSC Statutes 2013, 23<sup>rd</sup> Clause).

In this report the Motions are shown without names of the proposers and seconders because, once voted on they represent decisions made by the General Assembly as a whole.

## Overview of Process and Results

**Total motions submitted: 71**

**1) by deadline: 61**

**2) by the Governance Review Working Group: 9**

**3) at the General Assembly: 1**

**Total motions withdrawn: 31** (9 before the GA and 22 at the GA)

**Total motions amended at the GA: 28**

**Total motions voted on: 35**

**Total motions voted by show of cards: 17**

**Total motions voted by electronic ballot: 18**

**Total motions passed: 15**

Statutory (6); Policy (7, 16, 21, 34, 40, 46, 48, 56, 61, 62, 63, 67, 69, 71)

**Total motions rejected: 20**

Statutory (2, 3, 5); Policy (4, 8, 9, 19, 20, 25, 26, 27, 30, 37, 38, 50, 60, 64, 65, 66, 70)

**Total not voted on due to lack of time or other reasons: 5**

Policy: (11, 22, 28, 42, 68)

**Table 1. Passed Motions with weighted results for paper ballots**

No.	Title	Voted by	Overall Yes	Overall No	ECO Yes	ECO No	ENV Yes	ENV No	SOC Yes	SOC No
<b>Stat 6</b>	Conduct of the organization shall be guided by the principles of good governance	Cards								
<b>Policy 7</b>	Addressing Past Conversion through Restoration and Conservation as a Requirement for Certification of Plantations that have converted natural forest areas Post 1994	Cards								
<b>Policy 16</b>	Harnessing audit data to improve assurance integrity, M&E, and the value proposition for FSC	Cards								
<b>Policy 21</b>	Climate Motion	Paper ballot	79,14%	20,86%	58,21%	41,79%	85,96%	14,04%	93,23%	6,77%
<b>Policy 34</b>	Assessment of the economic viability of IFLs, in compliance with item 5 of Motion 65, in natural tropical forests (compliance with Principle 5 of the FSC)	Cards								
<b>Policy 40</b>	New IGI to clarify that FPIC is to be achieved over time through a mutually agreed process	Cards								
<b>Policy 46</b>	FSC New Approaches Program as a high-level priority for advancing smallholder and Community certification	Cards								
<b>Policy 48</b>	Fast-Track Non-Timber Forest Products (NTFP) in the implementation plan 2017-2020	Cards								
<b>Policy 56</b>	Ensuring that the Controlled Wood System is functional and credible until a strategy is in place.	Cards								
<b>Policy 61</b>	Certification Assessment Integrity and Credibility	Paper ballot	82,97%	17,03%	65,23%	34,77%	92,50%	7,50%	91,17%	8,83%
<b>Policy 62</b>	Statutory motion to review and revise membership criteria for chamber allocation and development of a protocol	Cards								
<b>Policy 63</b>	Make sure that strategic decisions on the FSC Network are directed and evaluated by FSC Board of Directors	Paper ballot	67.31%	32.69%	63.77%	36.23%	55.62%	44.38%	82.53%	17.47%
<b>Policy 67</b>	Establish an Internal Audit System	Paper ballot	71,12%	28,88%	71,07%	28,93%	62,02%	37,98%	80,27%	19,73%
<b>Policy 69</b>	Governance Review Phase II	Cards								
<b>Policy 71</b>	FSC supports Indigenous Cultural Landscapes	Cards								

**Table 2. Motions not voted on due to lack of time or other reasons as shown**

<b>No.</b>	<b>Title</b>
<b>Policy 11</b>	Give highest priority to implementation of Motion 27 GA2014 on Stakeholder Engagement Guidelines
<b>Policy 22</b>	Safeguarding credibility and assuring an ambitious level of national FSC-FM-Standards
<b>Policy 28</b>	Establish a fund raising platform for supporting forest management certification in critical for FSC cases
<b>Policy 42</b>	Develop social, environmental and economic indicators for the Implementation plan of the FSC Global Strategy 2015-2020
<b>Policy 68</b>	Establish an oversight mechanism

**Table 3. Rejected Motions with weighted results for ballots**

No.	Title	Voted by	Overall Yes	Overall No	ECO Yes	ECO No	ENV Yes	ENV No	SOC Yes	SOC No
Stat 2	Chamber Weighting of Voting for BoD Elections	Paper ballot	64,49%	35,51%	47,28%	52,72%	58,26%	41,74%	87,93%	12,07%
Stat 3	Formation of a 4th Indigenous Chamber	Paper ballot	27,12%	72,88%	6,64%	93,36%	14,24%	85,76%	60,49%	39,51%
Policy 4	Committee and ethic code to protect FSC integrity	Cards								
Stat 5	Addition of French as FSC's Third Official Language	Paper ballot	63,56%	36,44%	47,54%	52,46%	48,96%	51,04%	94,17%	5,83%
Policy 8	Improve the participation of stakeholders, the quality, and transparency of public consultations on the FSC normative framework	Paper ballot	49,02%	50,98%	69,28%	30,72%	37,91%	62,09%	39,86%	60,14%
Policy 9	Implement due diligence (impact analysis) for motions passed at a FSC® General Assembly and other potentially impactful proposals	Cards								
Policy 19	Develop a strategy and tools on forest restoration	Paper ballot	67,48%	32,52%	33,50%	66,50%	72,52%	27,48%	96,41%	3,59%
Policy 20	Promotion of FSC certification in protected areas and declared conservation zones	Paper ballot	48,51%	51,49%	26,68%	73,32%	36,38%	63,62%	82,47%	17,53%
Policy 25	Ensuring availability of digital GIS layers for borders of certified FMUs and key HCVFs within them	Paper ballot	73,88%	26,12%	41,78%	58,22%	95,65%	4,35%	84,21%	15,79%
Policy 26	Developing modern monitoring services for forest management units with use of remote sensing data	Cards								
Policy 27	Best practice guidelines on humane animal management within FMUs	Paper ballot	69,02%	30,98%	35,03%	64,97%	91,47%	8,53%	80,56%	19,44%
Policy 30	A more active FSC that influences government policies in order to carry out the Global Strategic Plan	Paper ballot	64,09%	35,91%	55,52%	44,48%	56,70%	43,30%	80,03%	19,97%
Policy 37	Landscape Approach to Protect Intact Forest Landscapes at the Landscape Level	Cards								
Policy 38	Indigenous Cultural Landscapes	Paper ballot	78,44%	21,56%	47,47%	52,53%	97,47%	2,53%	90,37%	9,63%
Policy 50	Strengthening social rights in Chain of Custody	Paper ballot	51,26%	48,74%	20,96%	79,04%	45,53%	54,47%	87,28%	12,72%
Policy 60	Inclusion of social expert in assessment audit team	Cards								
Policy 64	Building links between the local members representatives and the International BoD of FSC	Paper ballot	60,85%	39,15%	62,25%	37,75%	45,07%	54,93%	75,25%	24,75%
Policy 65	Regulation for interpretation of the Statutes related to the roles and responsibilities of the Board and Secretariat	Cards								
Policy 66	Unifying national and international membership	Cards								
Policy 70	Strengthen Normative Framework for Accreditation of FSC schemes	Cards								

## Part 2: Final Texts of Motions Passed

Total motions passed: 15

Statutory (6, 62, 63)

Policy (7, 16, 21, 34, 40, 46, 48, 56, 61, 62, 63, 67, 69, 71)

### 2.1 Statutory Motions (6, 62, 63)

06 / 2017

**Conduct of the organization shall be guided by the principles of good governance**

Statutory Motion Original language: Spanish

Result: **PASSED**

#### Statutory Motion (change to the Statutes):

Amend Clauses Seven and Eight of the Statutes

Present wording

SEVENTH. In compliance with its purpose and in relation with the same, the Organization shall undertake the following.

1. Promote Principles and Criteria of Forest Stewardship through a voluntary and independent accreditation and certification program for forest management.
2. Ensure evaluation and accreditation of Certification Bodies based upon adherence to FSC policies and to FSC requirements for Certification Bodies.
3. Conduct educational activities that increase awareness of the importance of improving forest management and the advantages of using certification as a tool to achieve this aim.
4. Provide guidance and assistance on issues related to responsible forest management to policy and decision makers, forest managers and legislators.

Suggested Amendment:

SEVENTH. In compliance with its purpose and in relation with the same, the Organization shall undertake the following:

1. Promote Principles and Criteria of Forest Stewardship through a voluntary and independent accreditation and certification program for forest management.
2. Ensure evaluation and accreditation of Certification Bodies based upon adherence to FSC policies and to FSC requirements for Certification Bodies.
3. Conduct educational activities that increase awareness of the importance of improving forest management and the advantages of using certification as a tool to achieve this aim.
4. Provide guidance and assistance on issues related to responsible forest management to policy and decision makers, forest managers and legislators.
5. Conduct of the Organization shall be guided by the principles of good governance.

Present wording:

EIGHTH. There are two main tenets of the Organization.

1. FSC's Principles and Criteria apply without discrimination to all tropical, temperate and boreal forests worldwide which are managed for the production of forest products and for the provision of ecosystem services over the long term. The Organization shall value equally the environmental, social and economic aspects of forest management included in its Principles and Criteria. The Organization shall be a non-profit non-governmental organization, and shall remain independent from control by commercial interests, and

government, multilateral and bilateral agencies, although collaboration with such entities will be sought. Government owned or controlled entities will only be admitted as members of the Organization under specific conditions set forth by the Board of Directors.

2.The Organization shall seek to complement national legislation and international treaties and agreements promoting environmentally appropriate, socially beneficial and economically viable forest management. FSC shall promote equitable access to accreditation and certification, and shall avoid discrimination against small-scale Certification Bodies or forest operations.

Suggested Amendment:

EIGHTH. There are two main tenets of the Organization

1.FSC's Principles and Criteria apply without discrimination to all tropical, temperate and boreal forests worldwide which are managed for the production of forest products and for the provision of ecosystem services over the long term. The Organization shall value equally the environmental, social and economic aspects of forest management included in its Principles and Criteria. The Organization shall be a non-profit non-governmental organization, and shall remain independent from control by commercial interests, and government, multilateral and bilateral agencies, although collaboration with such entities will be sought. Government owned or controlled entities will only be admitted as members of the Organization under specific conditions set forth by the Board of Directors.

2.The Organization shall seek to complement national legislation and international treaties and agreements promoting environmentally appropriate, socially beneficial and economically viable forest management. FSC shall promote equitable access to accreditation and certification, and shall avoid discrimination against small-scale Certification Bodies or forest operations.

3.The Organization shall be guided by the principles of good governance.

a) Inclusiveness and equitability: Ensuring members from all chambers and regions are able to participate, have equal voice, and are dealt with fairly

b) Transparency: Building trust in the system through openness, accountable decision making at all levels, clear principles and processes understood and applied by all, and access to information.

c) Consensus: Decision-making that achieves balance between participants, allows dissent, and leads to common and lasting agreements.

d) Efficiency and effectiveness: Decision-making that leads to practical, measurable outputs that benefit the world's forests and clearly deliver the FSC mission at all levels without jeopardizing the fundamentals of the organization.

e) Independence: A system that is free from interference from outside parties, does not allow one group to dominate or be dominated in the decision-making processes, and is clearly free from corruption.

f) Responsiveness: All stakeholders receive adequate and timely responses to their concerns

g) Accountability: Accepts responsibility for its activities and has transparent systems so it can be held accountable by the membership, the full range of stakeholders, and wider society.

h) Integrity and impartiality: Demonstrates integrity to deliver the FSC mission and impartiality in all of its activities.

62 / 2017

**Statutory motion to review and revise membership criteria for chamber allocation and development of a protocol**

Statutory Motion

Original language: English Result: **PASSED**

---

**Statutory Motion (change to the Statutes):**

Statutory Motion (change to the Statutes): Clause 20, Last paragraph: "In case of any doubt, the Board will have the final say.." change it to the following: "A membership protocol shall be in place to guide the Board's decisions on whether a Member..."

63 / 2017

**Make sure that strategic decisions on the FSC Network are directed and evaluated by FSC Board of Directors**

**AMENDED**

Statutory Motion

Original language: English Result: **PASSED**

---

Statutory Motion (change to the Statutes):

FSC shall add to Article 38 of the Statutes the following sentence: The strategic direction including the decisions on development and priority-setting of the FSC network will be determined and evaluated by the Board of Directors.

TITLE SIX

THE FSC NETWORK

THIRTY-EIGHTH. The Organization shall encourage and support national offices and other Network Partners, listed below, which are in line with the Organization's purpose and mission. The objectives of this are to decentralize the work of the Organization and to encourage local participation in a manner consistent with the structure and purpose of the Organization. The strategic direction including the decisions on development and priority-setting of the FSC network will be directed and evaluated by the Board of Directors. Guidelines and minimum requirements for national offices shall be prepared and published by the Secretariat and shall require that Network Partners seek consensus in their decisions. These decisions shall be taken in a manner which demonstrate the support of each chamber following the chamber model described in Clauses Nineteen and Twenty herein and as defined by the Organization. If an Organization's body is established in a country, it shall fit into one of the following categories.

**2.2 Policy (7, 16, 21, 34, 40, 46, 48, 56, 61, 62, 63, 67, 69, 71)**

07 / 2017

**Addressing Past Conversion through Restoration and Conservation as a Requirement for Certification of Plantations that have converted natural forest areas Post 1994**

**AMENDED**

Policy Motion

Original language: English

Result: **PASSED**

---

**Policy Motion** (high-level action request):

The membership recognizes the strategic importance of addressing the issues around conversion of natural forest-related ecosystems to plantations and the need for alignment of the diverse ways in which conversion is treated in different parts of the FSC normative framework.

The membership requests that FSC puts in place a mechanism, building upon previous work, which will develop a holistic policy and appropriate treatment at Principle, Criterion and Indicator



levels with guidance to national Standards Development Groups, considering compensation for past conversion, in terms of:

- a. restoration and/or conservation for environmental values; and
- b. restitution for socio-economic values

16 / 2017

### **Harnessing audit data to improve assurance integrity, M&E, and the value proposition for FSC**

**AMENDED**

Policy Motion

Original language: English

Result: **PASSED**

**Policy Motion** (high-level action request):

We ask FSC to improve the FSC-FM audit reporting and data management systems to better leverage the data already collected through FSC forest management (FSC-FM) auditing – with minimal added cost or burden – to generate consistent and accessible data needed to:

- Support evidence-driven improvement of standards
- Support and develop risk adjusted auditing
- Build next-generation assurance, monitoring and evaluation (M&E) systems

The data generated will support FSC's decision making, and enable better evaluation and communication of the benefits of FSC certification, and will help reinvigorate the value proposition of FSC.

21 / 2017

### **The Climate Motion**

**AMENDED**

Policy Motion

Original language: English

Result: **PASSED**

**Policy Motion** (high-level action request):

1. FSC to commission a review of the scientific literature, including those used by FSC Ecosystem Services, to investigate how FSC may assist Parties (Governments) to address the Cancun Safeguards.
2. The results of the investigation shall be approved by the FSC Board of Directors.
3. The approved findings shall be communicated to FSC members and Parties to the Climate Change Convention.
4. FSC shall apply to the UNFCCC to join the Climate Change discussions, which will allow the organisation to work directly with signatory Parties (Governments).

34 / 2017

### **Regional assessments of the impacts of the implementation of Motion 65/2014**

**AMENDED**

Policy Motion

Original language: English

Result: **PASSED**

**Policy Motion** (high-level action request):

Enable the conducting of regional assessments of the short and long-term impacts – positive and negative – of the management and protection measures associated with the implementation of Motion 65/2014 and the International Generic Indicators (IGI) which are the starting point for developing National Standards. In accordance with item 5 of the Motion, these assessments should compare various scenarios of implementing Motion 65/2014 and the IGIs and consider the environmental, social, and economic dimensions. Particular effort will be made to ensure the inclusion of impacts on indigenous Peoples, traditional peoples and forest dependent communities in these assessments.

**Policy Motion** (high-level action request):

The following small edits to IGIs related to Indigenous Peoples, and a new IGI allowing a mutually-agreed FPIC process, advancing to the community's satisfaction, when the community finds it of higher value than being rushed to conclude an FPIC agreement in order for the certification applicant to comply with criterion 3.3 by the time of the next audit, specifically:

A) 3.1.2: Delete the word "issues". The proposed wording for the IGI is as follows: 3.1.2 Through culturally appropriate\* engagement\* with the Indigenous Peoples\* identified in 3.1.1, the following are documented and/or mapped.

B) 3.2.4.2 & 4.2.4.2: Delete the words "over which they are considering delegation of control". The proposed wording for the IGI is as follows: 3.2.4.2 & 4.2.4 Free, prior and informed consent\* is granted by Indigenous Peoples\*/local communities\* prior to management activities that affect their identified rights through a process that includes:... 2) Informing the Indigenous Peoples\*/local communities\* of the value of the resource, in economic, social and environmental terms;

C) The proposed wording for the new IGI is as follows:

3.2.5 Where The FPIC process has not yet resulted in an FPIC agreement, the Organisation and the affected Indigenous Peoples\*/local communities are engaged in a mutually agreed FPIC process that is advancing, in good faith\* and with which the community is satisfied.

\*Good Faith is a term used in ILO Conventions and recognized as an auditable element: The principle of good faith implies that the parties make every effort to reach an agreement, conduct genuine and constructive negotiations, avoid delays in negotiations, respect agreements concluded and applied in, and give sufficient time to discuss and settle disputes.

**Policy Motion** (high-level action request):

Prioritize implementation of the FSC New Approaches program including communication of progress and results, with emphasis on core actions within that program needed to significantly advance the ability of smallholders and Communities to access, maintain and capture the benefits of FSC certification. Such actions include:

- o Ground-truthing, approval and international implementation of the Community Certification tool (as per Motion 2014:83);
- o Development and implementation of a Contractor Certification scheme; and, exploration and implementation of other mechanisms for improving access for smallholders in countries where Contractor Certification is not considered appropriate;
- o Revision of the Group Certification standard, including a comprehensive evaluation of the current standard to identify strengths/weaknesses and potential barriers that could be removed, and development of solutions and tools to enhance group certification (e.g., simplification, applying contractor certification and risk-based approach in group certification context, etc.);
- o A robust strategy to develop and improve access and markets for forest products and services derived from smallholders and Communities, including creating real incentives for certified companies to increase smallholder and Community uptake in their supply chain;
- o Fast-track the exploration, piloting and system-wide uptake of risk-based approaches for smallholders and Communities;

- o Support to National Standard Development Groups to ensure that the full potential of Scale, Intensity and Risk (SIR) considerations result in simplified standards for smallholders, particularly for very small forest owners (thresholds to be decided on national level), ;
- o A study of the costs associated with the smallholder certification audit process and recommendations for making the process more cost-effective, including potential financial mechanisms for both implementation and verification costs (this can be included within the study of Smallholders typologies and recommendations from the Community Standard development process).

While maintaining its commitment to effectively resource and implement the New Approaches program, FSC shall also incorporate the following elements into its approach:

- o A communications strategy that targets smallholders, group managers, Communities, certification bodies, and other practitioners, and that includes user-friendly guidance, best practices, templates and other techniques aimed at rapid adoption and diffusion of innovation;
- o A partnership strategy which serves to create and build on relationships with other organizations working for or with forest smallholders and Communities aimed at creating synergies and advancing certification and benefits for the target groups;
- o Conduct a number of trial or pilot projects in selected countries, preferably in collaboration with other organizations as described above, to assess the feasibility of different approaches;
- o Research the pros and cons and potential of including the element of ecosystem services in the new approaches (e.g. as a stand-alone standard, combined with the Community Standard, or as a separate annex to FM standard)
- o Research on how the FSC system can increase the confidence of responsible investors and their engagement with the products and services provided by FSC certified smallholders and communities.

48 / 2017

**Fast-Track Non-Timber Forest Products (NTFP) in the implementation plan 2017-2020**

Policy Motion

Original language: English

Result: **PASSED**

**Policy Motion** (high-level action request):

FSC shall prioritise Non-Timber Forest Products (NTFP) in the Implementation plan 2017-2020 and be able to demonstrate that they have developed new and successful tools to aid certification and marketing of NTFP.

56 / 2017

**Ensuring that the Controlled Wood System is functional and credible until a strategy is in place**

**AMENDED**

Policy Motion

Original language: English

Result: **PASSED**

**Policy Motion** (high-level action request):

**1** Implementation of the new system and standards:

The membership affirms that the approved standards for the development of National Risk Assessments and the new Controlled Wood and related Auditor Standards shall be implemented in full with no use of company based risk assessments permissible beyond January 1st 2019. An exception will be made where PSU has received but not processed a CNRA and or a NRA before this date. The membership expects that the resources required to implement this will be made available and updates on progress will be clearly reported.

**2** Controlled wood strategy development

The whole spectrum of possible outcomes from phasing out CW to continuing to use CW shall be given fair consideration during the CW strategy development process. Within a month of the 2017 GA, a small team representing all three chambers and the diversity of perspectives shall be set up to assist the secretariat in preparing for the CW strategy meeting to be held in June 2018. The team will facilitate communication and information sharing. FSC shall provide the resources necessary to support the process between the GA and the CW strategy meeting. The selection of participants in the CW strategy meeting, and the rationale for their selection shall be open and transparent and shall result in a balance of stakeholders across the spectrum of opinion. The CW strategy stemming from the meeting shall go to consultation with the membership before it is submitted to the Board for approval.

To support the CW strategy development process, FSC shall, as a matter of urgency, obtain and provide data necessary to support sound decision making. The nature of this data and the reasonable timeframe in which it can be produced shall be worked out between the team and the secretariat in the first stage of the process.

61 / 2017

### Certification Assessment Integrity and Credibility

AMENDED

Policy Motion

Original language: English

Result: PASSED

#### Policy Motion (high-level action request):

FSC shall undertake an impartial and independent review and evaluation of the system for delivering certification auditing and assessment services to:

- Identify and address any issues that may exist in the system that would threaten the integrity and objectivity of the FSC assurance system, taking into consideration varying levels of risk in different contexts; and,
- Propose potential solutions to address any issues that are identified to strengthen the rigor, objectivity and credibility of the assurance system.

67 / 2017

### Establish an Internal Audit System

AMENDED

Policy Motion

Original language: English

Result: PASSED

#### Policy Motion (high-level action request):

The FSC Governance Review Working Group propose that FSC establishes a system to carry out systematic and independent Internal Audit to internationally recognized standards. The aim shall be to promote good management practice and to ensure the implementation of good governance principles. The system should aim to provide information and data to help with performance evaluation of the Board and Secretariat and on implementation of plans and policies and provide information to the membership.

69 / 2017

### Governance Review Phase II

AMENDED

Policy Motion

Original language: English

Result: PASSED

#### Policy Motion (high-level action request):

The FSC membership recommend the continuation of the governance review. This shall include:

- a) Further exploration of future governance structures to enable FSC to build on and strengthen levels of engagement and participation of the membership as the organisation grows, including an analysis of the implications of potentially expanding representative

participation and including mechanisms to better engage key stakeholder groups as identified in the Global Strategic Plan.

- b) Following up on and monitoring the implementation of the recommendations given by the Governance Review Working Group which are agreed by the Board and of the GRWG motions which are approved by the membership, against the principles of good governance.
- c) A strategy and action plan to ensure best institutional governance, transparency and accountability of the management and administration of FSC, including its subsidiaries and national offices, in relation to FSC's objectives and principles of good governance, by implementing comprehensive systems for monitoring, evaluation and reporting to the membership.

71 / 2017

**FSC supports Indigenous Cultural Landscapes**

**AMENDED**

Policy Motion

Original language: English

Result: **PASSED**

---

**Policy Motion** (high-level action request):

FSC supports Indigenous Cultural Landscapes and respects Free Prior Informed Consent in Intact Forest Landscapes.

## Part 3: Final Texts of Motions Rejected

Total motions rejected: (20)

Statutory (2, 3, 5)

Policy (4, 8, 9, 19, 20, 25, 26, 27, 30, 37, 38, 50, 60, 64, 65, 66, 70)

### 3.1 Statutory Motions (2, 3, 5)

02 / 2017

#### Chamber Weighting of Voting for BoD Elections

AMENDED

Statutory Motion

Original language: English

Result: **REJECTED**

##### Statutory Motion (change to the Statutes):

Amend the TWENTY-FIFTH section of the statutes to read "...The quorum and voting power for the election of a Board of Directors through a vote at a General Assembly or by a postal or electronic ballot shall be calculated according to the provision set forth in Clauses Nineteen and Twenty-Three above, with the addition of all votes from the chamber of the nominated candidate shall collectively be weighted to account for 50% of the total vote for the candidate."

Current:

TWENTY-FIFTH. Members of the Board of Directors shall be elected for a four-year term from the date of their respective appointment. Notwithstanding the above, six members of the Board, one from each sub-chamber, shall be appointed every two years in order to substitute the members of the Board ending their office. The Board of Directors will receive seconded nominations of candidates and will prepare a written ballot classifying each candidate into the appropriate sub-chamber (e.g. Northern/Environmental) to be submitted to the election of the General Assembly. The quorum and voting power for the election of a Board of Directors through a vote at a General Assembly or by a postal or electronic ballot shall be calculated according to the provision set forth in Clauses Nineteen and Twenty-Three above.

03 / 2017

#### Formation of a 4th Indigenous Chamber

Statutory Motion

Original language: English

Result: **REJECTED**

##### Statutory Motion (change to the Statutes):

Title Two, Members, Eleventh of the statutes:

Original:

"As further explained in Title Three of these Statutes, the General Assembly of the Organization is made up of three chambers. The Organization's membership criteria to the three chambers is described in Clause Twentieth."

Proposed Change:

"As further explained in Title Three of these Statutes, the General Assembly of the Organization is made up of four chambers. The Organization's membership criteria to the four chambers is described in Clause Twentieth. "

Title Three, GENERAL ASSEMBLIES, Nineteenth:

Original:

NINETEENTH. The General Assembly shall be made up of three chambers. The purpose of the chamber structure is to maintain the balance of voting power between different interests

without having to limit the number of Members. The votes within each chamber shall be divided equally between the

Members, while respecting the provisions set forth herein. If additional Members join a chamber, the voting power of existing Members will dilute accordingly.

As further explained in Clause Twentieth, the Social Chamber shall be made up of social and indigenous organizations and assigned individuals and will have one third of the voting power in the General Assembly. The Environmental Chamber shall be made up of environmental organizations and assigned individuals and will have one third of the voting power in the General Assembly. The Economic Chamber shall be made up of individuals and organizations with an economic interest in forest management operations and/or in the forest products trade, and will have one third of the voting power in the General Assembly.

Proposed Change:

The General Assembly shall be made up of four chambers: " the Social Chamber shall be made up of social organizations and assigned individuals and will have one fourth of the voting power in the General Assembly. The Indigenous Chamber shall be made up of indigenous peoples' organizations and assigned individuals and will have one fourth of the voting power in the General Assembly. The Environmental Chamber shall be made up of environmental organizations and assigned individuals and will have one fourth of the voting power in the General Assembly. The Economic Chamber shall be made up of individuals and organizations with an economic interest in forest management operations and/or in the forest products trade, and will have one fourth of the voting power in the General Assembly. To achieve a balance between Northern and Southern perspectives within each chamber, there shall be 'Northern' and 'Southern' sub-chambers within each of the four chambers,"

Title Three, GENERAL ASSEMBLIES, Twentieth:

Original:

"The Organization's membership criteria to the three chambers shall be as follows."

Proposed Change:

The Organization's membership criteria to the four chambers shall be as follows.

Original:

2. Membership of the Social Chamber shall be open to individuals and not-for-profit organizations whose principal purpose and interest is socially beneficial forestry, including, but not limited to the following.

- a) Socially oriented communally-owned organizations, indigenous organizations and community groups.
- b) Trade unions, labor unions and workers associations.
- c) Non-Governmental Organizations engaged in social development, social justice, strengthening civil society or similar.
- d) Organizations and associations working to promote recreational uses of forests.
- e) Research organizations and academics whose primary interests are social issues within forestry.
- f) Development non-governmental organizations.
- g) Employees, consultants and representatives of the above.

Proposed:

2. a) Socially oriented communally-owned organizations and community groups.

Proposed:

4. Membership of the Indigenous Chamber shall be open to individuals, not-for-profit, and indigenous nation owned and majority controlled forest management organizations, whose

principal purpose and interest is promoting forestry in benefit of Indigenous Peoples, including, but not limited to the following.

- a) Socially oriented indigenous organizations and community groups.
- b) Non-Governmental Organizations engaged in social development, social justice, strengthening civil society or similar to empower Indigenous Peoples.
- c) Research organizations and academics whose primary interests are Indigenous Peoples issues within forestry.
- d) Development non-governmental organizations.
- e) Employees, consultants and representatives of the above."

Original:

In case of any doubt, the Board will have the final say on whether a Member should be assigned to the Economic, Social or Environmental Chamber.

Proposed:

"In case of any doubt, the Board will have the final say on whether a Member should be assigned to the Economic, Social, Indigenous or Environmental Chamber." The Permanent Indigenous Peoples Committee, as an organ of the Board, may be asked for advice concerning assignment and confirmation of Indigenous membership as necessary."

Title Three, GENERAL ASSEMBLIES, Twenty-third:

Original:

5. The General Assembly shall strive to adopt decisions by consensus. For decisions to be made at any Ordinary or Extraordinary General Assembly, a quorum of more than 50% of the voting power of Members in good standing in each of the three chambers shall be required. In order to adopt resolutions at any Ordinary or Extraordinary General Assembly, the affirmative vote of both a simple majority of the voting power of Members in good standing in each chamber present at the time of the vote and at least two thirds of the voting power of all Members in good standing present at the time of the vote, shall be required. The members must be in good standing at the time of the meeting.

Proposed Change:

5. The General Assembly shall strive to adopt decisions by consensus. For decisions to be made at any Ordinary or Extraordinary General Assembly, a quorum of more than 50% of the voting power of Members in good standing in each of the four chambers shall be required.

Original:

9. Members may be represented at any General Assembly by any other Member, designated in writing before two witnesses, on the understanding that at a specific General Assembly:

- (i) a Member can only represent a maximum of five organizational Members that could be part of any of the three chambers, and
- (ii) a Member can represent an unlimited number of individual Members who could be part of any of the three chambers.

Proposed:

9. (i) a Member can only represent a maximum of five organizational Members that could be part of any of the four chambers, and (ii) a Member can represent an unlimited number of individual Members who could be part of any of the economic, social, or environment chambers. With respect to the Indigenous chamber, individual indigenous proxy designations must be assigned only to bona fide indigenous individuals and organizations.

TITLE FOUR

MANAGEMENT OF THE ORGANIZATION

BOARD OF DIRECTORS.:



Original:

TWENTY-FOURTH. The Organization shall be managed by a Board of Directors composed of twelve members elected by the General Assembly.

Proposed change:

"The Organization shall be managed by a Board of Directors composed of 16 members elected by the General Assembly".

Original:

TWENTY-FIFTH. Members of the Board of Directors shall be elected for a four-year term from the date of their respective appointment. Notwithstanding the above, six members of the Board, one from each sub-chamber, shall be appointed every two years in order to substitute the members of the Board ending

their office.

Proposed:

25th.: Members of the Board of Directors shall be elected for a four-year term from the date of their respective appointment. Notwithstanding the above, eight members of the Board,"

Original:

TWENTY-SEVENTH. A quorum shall exist at any meeting of the Board if at least ten of its members are present, with at least two from each chamber.

Proposed:

27th.: A quorum shall exist at any meeting of the Board if at least twelve of its members are present, with at least two from each chamber."

05 / 2017

## Addition of French as FSC's Third Official Language

Statutory Motion

Original language: English

Result: **REJECTED**

### Statutory Motion (change to the Statutes):

Present wording:

TITLE ONE. Third clause. The official languages of the Organization shall be Spanish and English. The main documents and materials published by the Organization shall be available in both languages. All documents submitted to the Organization, such as standards, applications and Principles and Criteria will be made available in English and Spanish by the Organization. Other languages may be added if approved by the General Assembly.

These statutes are available both in English and Spanish, and both texts shall be binding and constitute one single document; in the understanding, however, that in the event of differences between both versions, the English version shall prevail.

Suggested Amendment:

TITLE ONE, Third clause, shall read: The official languages of the Organization shall be Spanish, French and English. The main documents and materials published by the Organization shall be available in all three languages. All documents submitted to the Organization, such as standards, applications and Principles and Criteria will be made available in English, French and Spanish by the Organization. Other languages may be added if approved by the General Assembly.

These statutes are available both in English, French and Spanish, and both texts shall be binding and constitute one single document; in the understanding, however, that in the event of differences between any of the versions, the English version shall prevail.

### 3.2 Policy (4, 8, 9, 19, 20, 25, 26, 27, 30, 37, 38, 50, 60, 64, 65, 66, 70)

04 / 2017

#### Committee and ethic code to protect FSC integrity

AMENDED

Policy Motion

Original language: Spanish

Result: **REJECTED**

---

#### Policy Motion (high-level action request):

Create an independent committee and a code of ethics to ensure the credibility, transparency and integrity of the FSC against actions, situations or claims not contemplated or sanctioned in current FSC statutes, the Policy of Association and other FSC regulatory policies.

08 / 2017

#### Improve the participation of stakeholders, the quality, and transparency of public consultations on the FSC normative framework

AMENDED

Policy Motion

Original language: English

Result: **REJECTED**

---

#### Policy Motion (high-level action request):

FSC shall provide stakeholders with the opportunity to a higher-quality participation in public consultation and improve the capacity of giving feedback for all revision processes of the normative framework by implementing the 5 actions below:

1. Develop an Annual Plan (schedule) for public consultations to avoid overlapping;
2. Limit the number of Working Groups to a maximum of three at the same time. A clear prioritization process shall be set and the Board of Directors shall be responsible for deciding which WG will be established;
3. Ensure that all public consultation processes end up with a Results Report publicly available to all stakeholders with acceptable quality, with adequate time and efficiently communicated;
4. Establish public transparent criteria to accept/reject comments when evaluating the comments received at the public consultations;
5. Provide updated status of participation of each chamber during the public consultations, as a reminder to the membership.

09 / 2017

#### Implement due diligence (impact analysis) for motions passed at a FSC® General Assembly and other potentially impactful proposals

AMENDED

Policy Motion

Original language: English

Result: **REJECTED**

---

#### Policy Motion (high-level action request):

To support the integrity of FSC® and supplement Motion GA2014/1, motions passed at a General Assembly (GA) and other potentially impactful proposals developed by the FSC® Board of Directors, the secretariat or other governance bodies of FSC® should undergo formal due diligence/ impact analysis. The level of detail and complexity of the analysis will vary depending on the scope of the motion/proposal (Note: the intent of this motion is not to inhibit progress on motions/proposals but rather strengthen them in terms of alignment with the mission/vision of FSC® and the Global Strategic Plan)

- a) If significant environmental, social or economic impacts are found that demonstrate that the motion does not contribute positively to advancing the FSC® mission, vision and Global

Strategic Plan, the FSC® Board of Directors must notify the membership of these facts and provide a means for the membership to vote again, to modify, or drop the motion.

- b) For 'other proposals' evaluated through impact analysis (i.e., not GA-approved motions) that may not positively advance FSC®, the FSC® Board of Directors would guide a process to drop or revise said proposal to make it fully compatible with the Global Strategic Plan, operational capacity, policies and principles of FSC®.
- c) The results of impact analysis will be made available to all FSC® members.

Immediately following GA 2017 the Board of Directors of FSC® and secretariat at FSC® International should:

- guide a process to develop details of the impact analysis (including aspects such as: criteria for analysis, who undertakes the impact analysis, if (and how) external expertise are used, whether proponents should be included & whether the analysis has a participatory element).
- develop process for communicating the results of the impact analysis and advancing implementation and/or revision of the motions or other proposal.

19 / 2017

### Develop a strategy and tools on forest restoration

**AMENDED**

Policy Motion

Original language: English

Result: **REJECTED**

**Policy Motion** (high-level action request):

1. FSC shall establish a framework for the development of a strategy and tools for forest restoration.
2. The strategy shall be incorporated into FSC's programs and the 2015-20 implementation plan.

20 / 2017

### Promotion of FSC certification in protected areas and declared conservation zones

Policy Motion

Original language: Spanish

Result: **REJECTED**

**Policy Motion** (high-level action request):

Strategically, FSC to again give attention to the issue of Protected Areas in its full dimensions. A series of actions taken previously by FSC related to Protected Areas will be reviewed. Urgent priority will be given to a roadmap for an analysis and exploration of certification possibilities in protected areas, with a close link to Mission, Vision, Principles, Criteria and the FSC Global Strategic Plan 2015-2020.

25 / 2017

### Ensuring availability of digital GIS layers for borders of certified FMUs and key HCVFs within them

**AMENDED**

Policy Motion

Original language: English

Result: **REJECTED**

**Policy Motion** (high-level action request):

Certificate holders (with the exemption of smallholders and Communities) shall have up-to-date borders of certified forest management units (MUs) digitized as a layer for the Geographic Information System. FSC shall develop guidelines describing the process, with minimum requirements to format and spatial accuracy of such layers. This information shall be publicly available with exceptions to protect confidential economic, HCV, Indigenous knowledge or other sensitive information.

26 / 2017

**Developing modern monitoring services for forest management units with use of remote sensing data**

**AMENDED**

Policy Motion

Original language: English

Result: **REJECTED**

---

**Policy Motion** (high-level action request):

There should be an up-to-date service from FSC to its customers (i.e. certificate holders, certification bodies, stakeholders) to have access to remote sensing data for certified areas with spatial resolution, which is adequate for particular local conditions. In some exclusive and critical cases there should be a mechanism to provide detailed and comprehensive analyses for the certain limited area in order to support certification there.

27 / 2017

**Best practice guidelines on humane animal management within FMUs**

**AMENDED**

Policy Motion

Original language: English

Result: **REJECTED**

---

**Policy Motion** (high-level action request):

The FSC shall create best practice guidelines for humane management of animals (vertebrate species) within FMUs, where relevant, in consultation with relevant experts and stakeholders, to inform and support certified organisations in the implementation of their management plans.

Considerations during the drafting of best practice guidelines:

The importance of indigenous and traditional peoples' rights and those of local communities with regards to culture, food-gathering and recreation should be recognised.

These guidelines should:

- Prioritise non-lethal methods, where effective, and seek to minimise suffering;
- Cover both wildlife species and working animals;
- Consider existing nationally-ratified international treaties, conventions and agreements as well as internationally recognised standards, for example:
- Dubois, S. et al. (2017), International consensus principles for ethical wildlife control. Conservation Biology (<http://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1111/cobi.12896/full>);
- Guidelines developed for specific taxa – for example the IUCN Best Practice Guidelines to Reduce the Impact of Logging on Great Apes ([http://www.primatesg.org/best\\_practice\\_logging/](http://www.primatesg.org/best_practice_logging/)).

30 / 2017

**A more active FSC that influences government policies in order to carry out the Global Strategic Plan**

Policy Motion

Original language: Spanish

Result: **REJECTED**

---

**Policy Motion** (high-level action request):

FSC should set a clear policy for relations with governments and the relevant strategies that permit interaction, establishing alliances, influencing policies, etc. – as the case may be - with a view to achieving the goals of FSC's Global Strategic Plan.

37 / 2017

## Landscape Approach to Protect Intact Forest Landscapes at the Landscape Level

AMENDED

Policy Motion

Original language: English

Result: **REJECTED**

---

### Policy Motion (high-level action request):

In order to improve and broaden effective protection of IFLs, FSC shall initiate a process to develop a Landscape Approach that should take into account, among other factors, the following:

- Abundance of IFL in the region in which the FMU is located;
- The range of threats to IFLs taking into account the local context, including risks from the outside of the FSC certified forest sector and rate of loss of IFLs since 2000;
- Comparative levels of HCVs in different parts of the IFL, which could guide core area delineation both within and without the FMU;
- Diversity of stakeholders, interaction between them and governance systems in various landscapes across the world

FSC shall create 2 experts panels (one for tropics and subtropics, and another for boreal and temperate), including international experts to explore mechanisms to engage with other relevant stakeholders, promote sustainable forest management and IFL protection beyond certification at the landscape level, including payment for ecosystem services (i.e. especially conservation values, eco-accounts and other set-aside options) as stepping stones to certification, and integration of HCV and IFL decision-making within FSC into regional land-use and conservation planning. These panels should assess all risks and opportunities for introducing this landscape approach, taking into account national features. The panels could be established at the basis of the IFL Solutions Forum.

38 / 2017

## Indigenous Cultural Landscapes

AMENDED

Policy Motion

Original language: English

Result: **REJECTED**

---

### Policy Motion (high-level action request):

That FSC International, in partnership with the Permanent Indigenous Peoples Committee and Indigenous members, solicit advice from a mutually acceptable group of experts, including Indigenous experts, in order to further develop the Indigenous Cultural Landscapes concept and provide recommendations on possible applications of the concept to facilitate implementation of principles 3, 6 and 9. These recommendations will be submitted to the International Board of Directors for consideration prior to the next GA.

50 / 2017

## Strengthening social rights in Chain of Custody

Policy Motion

Original language: English

Result: **REJECTED**

---

### Policy Motion (high-level action request):

As one of the key recommendations from the Social Chamber, this policy motion requires that the FSC Chain of Custody (FSC-STD- 40-004 v3) strengthens its provisions on social clauses. Workers in the forestry industry have the same founding social rights as stipulated in the FSC International Forestry Standard.

60 / 2017

**Inclusion of social expert in assessment audit team**

Policy Motion

Original language: English

Result: **REJECTED**

---

**Policy Motion** (high-level action request):

Social experts shall be required in all audit teams. The existing wording in Annex 3 of standard No FSC-STD-20-001 V4-0, (Box 2) shall be changed accordingly, so that under the section, Social Issues, the words now read:

The Audit team shall include members with social expertise, including with local communities, indigenous and community rights, tenure issues, worker's rights and interpretation of the FSC social High Conservation Values (HCV). The team shall include experts with appropriate language/dialect (or translators), and experience of interacting with indigenous peoples and communities in the region concerned. The team shall include members with knowledge and capacity to evaluate workers' rights such as health and safety aspects and application of employment legislation in the region.

64 / 2017

**Building links between the local members representatives and the International BoD of FSC**

**AMENDED**

Policy Motion

Original language: English

Result: **REJECTED**

---

**Policy Motion** (high-level action request):

Incorporate into the regional or other membership meetings or BoD International meetings, a space for regional committees, comprised of National Board members (who are also International FSC members). They will meet annually with RO/ National/International Directors to harmonise the Strategic Plan for the region, and identify and agree priorities together with the RO staff and agree ways to evaluate progress. They would enhance monitoring and accountability yearly, starting the meeting by reviewing the evidence of progress with implementation of those priorities, and report to the International Board. In case of dispute, the higher authority (International Board) decides. The International Board, in turn, needs to oversee the development of these regional forums to protect One FSC.

65 / 2017

**Regulation for interpretation of the Statutes related to the roles and responsibilities of the Board and Secretariat**

**AMENDED**

Policy Motion

Original language: English

Result: **REJECTED**

---

**Policy Motion** (high-level action request):

This motion proposes to create a specific regulation that provide clarity and regarding roles and responsibilities of Board, Director General and Secretariat and all institutional bodies.

66 / 2017

**Unifying national and international membership**

**AMENDED**

Policy Motion

Original language: English

Result: **REJECTED**

---

**Policy Motion** (high-level action request):

This motion proposes the unification of national and international membership in those countries that have both categories, with the possibility of members choosing, at the international level, between full (voting) and affiliated members (without voting rights). The necessary transition arrangements shall be defined. An impact assessment of the implications of unifying the membership is needed before implementation to include potential impacts on quorum and financial impacts for national offices.

**Policy Motion** (high-level action request):

FSC shall review and strengthen a normative framework that governs the operation and performance of accreditation of FSC schemes in order to ensure effectiveness and credibility. The revision of the normative framework should to include at a minimum:

- A scoping of the problem areas in the accreditation and oversight functions that need to be addressed through a stakeholder consultation process
- Advice of an outside expert counsel on absence of competition risks and mitigation measures
- Benchmark analysis of other oversight models, including consultation with ISEAL
- Develop a system to monitor and evaluate the delivery of the accreditation services that incorporates stakeholder consultation and transparency of audit results
- Accessible and efficient dispute resolution process following norms for independent investigation
- Consideration of aspects for FSC to more directly participate in the oversight functions
- Delivery of cost effective accreditation services
- Final public consultation of the revised framework, prior to finalization